

**PERSONNEL AND COMPENSATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES**

**FRIDAY, JANUARY 19, 2018
3:30 P.M.**

PRESENT: John S. Vero, Chairman,
Leigh J. Benton, Thomas J. Faggione, Paul Ruskiewicz,
Rob Sassi, Joel Sierra, Kathy A. Stegenga

ALSO

PRESENT: L. Stephen Brescia, Chairman
Katie Bonelli, Majority Leader
Michael D. Paduch, Minority Leader
Barry Cheney, Legislator
Kevin W. Hines, Legislator
James M. Kulisek, Legislator
Kevindaryan Lujan, Legislator
Joseph Minuta, Legislator
James O'Donnell, Legislator
Antoinette Reed, Legislative Counsel
Wayne Booth, Deputy County Executive
Harold Porr, III, Director of Operations
Mary Pat Smith, Assistant to the County Executive
Langdon Chapman, County Attorney
Susan Whalen, Assistant County Attorney
Steve Gross, Commissioner of Human Resources
Donna McCarey, Deputy Commissioner, Human Resources
Alison Tyack, Director of Personnel Management, Human Resources
Erik Denega, Commissioner, Dept. of Public Works
James S. Brooks, Deputy Commissioner, Infrastructure Services
Stephen Knob, Director, Employment and Training Administration
Deborah Slesinski, Deputy Budget Director
Michael Ventre, Budget Analyst

Mr. Vero called the meeting to order at 3:30 p.m. and asked everyone to stand for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag. All members were present with the exception of Ms. Tautel who was absent.

Mr. Faggione moved the request to confirm the appointment of James S. Brooks as Commissioner of Parks, Recreation and Conservation, seconded by Mr. Benton.

Mr. Vero confirmed that the county has been without a Parks, Recreation and Conservation Commissioner for almost a year.

Mr. Gross confirmed that the position has been vacant since January 9, 2017.

Mr. Porr explained that after Mr. Rose left, Commissioner Viebrock took over as Acting Commissioner. They searched the market and received about sixty resumes and after review

no one really jumped out at them. Mr. Brooks was one of the sixty. When Mr. Cappozella and Mr. Viebrock left, Mr. Brooks stepped in with his team and took over where they left off. They could see first-hand his ability to manage crews, make decisions, negotiate with contractors and to lead. Mr. Brooks does not have park program experience but since Mr. Rose left, everything has been running as it is supposed to. There is an employee who has been with the county for 31 years and he has been running all the activities and programs at the Parks Department. Another employee who has been with the county for 11 years has helped run the programs at the Parks Department as well. Mr. Porr added that there is a vacant position, Museum Coordinator, that has been vacant for four years that they should fill.

Mr. Porr explained that Mr. Brooks' job as Commissioner would be to manage those employees running the programs and filling that vacancy which would help him out. They support Mr. Brooks based on his performance that they witnessed. They see a very good fit with his skill set and the county parks program.

Mrs. Bonelli thanked Mr. Porr because when she sat in on one of the initial interviews and noted that Mr. Brooks has a lot of expertise on the management side of it but they were concerned about the program aspect of the position. She was happy that Mr. Porr provided the presentation because that was one of the concerns that they had. She personally worked with Mr. Brooks and he has been responsive and he stepped up to the plate and got us moved into the building and she thanked him for an excellent job. She had some issues in her district and concerns on county property and he handled it very professionally.

Mr. Faggione mentioned that in his district there is the D & H Canal Park and the Harriet Space Park and he is encouraged and excited that with Mr. Brooks and Mr. Denega he feels that they have a great team that can assess the situation in the Town of Deerpark and come up with a real plan that will work for the residents and bring people via tourism into Orange County. He was encouraged by Mr. Brooks' background and he fully supports and endorses him as the new Parks Commissioner.

Mr. Paduch sat in on one interview, there were sixty applicants and he was able to sit with one person. This was nothing personal against Mr. Brooks, he thinks that he does a great job and he thinks that he could handle all the maintenance at the parks and the county needs someone like him to work with the volunteers and get reports. That was one of his concerns because the questions he asked during the interview were from board members at Hill Hold and from the volunteers. He did not see the background in Mr. Brooks for this position and again stated that this was not personal at all. They have such a huge parks program in Orange County and it is great to have good people under you but in his discussion with the volunteers who do so much work, that is the part he likes because he can see the things that are brought up, the things that need maintenance, that is stuff he knows will get done and that is why he is OK with Mr. Brooks being the Commissioner. He suggested to Mr. Brooks that he be mindful, speak with the volunteers, speak with the board members quarterly or monthly because they are frustrated that the people who have been in the position in the past made promises but things were not done.

Mr. Sierra asked how long the appointment was and Mr. Gross advised him it was at the pleasure of the County Executive. Mr. Sierra stated that he owns his own business and if you have the ability to lead people, you can lead them whether it be a sock factory or a parts department, it is a talent in itself. If you are a leader, then you are a leader. If the

County Executive thinks that he is qualified then he will take that into consideration and he wished him well.

Mr. Cheney mentioned the current programs and how it was being covered. The last Parks Master Plan was in 2000 and was probably not fully implemented. His concern was how do they adapt their parks for the future and what do they need to start doing to meet the needs of our residents so they have parks that are responsive to what they want to see in them.

Mr. Brooks stated that he was able to review the Parks, Recreation and Conservation Master Plan a few weeks ago and the first thing he would like done is to update the plan. Everything that the committee has mentioned, the D & H Canal, program concerns, is all in the plan. As far as the programs go, he would like to see what the response is from the residents and the taxpayers.

Mr. Benton has known Mr. Brooks for a long time and is fully supportive of him for this position.

Chairman Brescia has known Mr. Brooks for a long time as well and he has all the confidence that he will work very hard to improve on programs and everything in the parks system. He reminded Mr. Brooks that he and Mr. Paduch are on the same page about a pre-master plan. He is aware that he'll have his hands full with the Heritage Trail which is the top priority with Parks for 2018. They do have money in the capital account that has been sitting there that they do not want to use in municipal park grants but we want to use it for our park system.

Motion carried. All in favor.

Mr. Faggione moved the request to create one
Director of Tourism, Management Grade 25,
seconded by Mrs. Stegenga.

Mr. Porr shared that in October 2016 the County Executive proposed \$140,000 in the 2017 budget to enhance their tourism efforts and create the new position of Tourism Director on staff. In December 2016 the County Legislature adopted the budget with only \$140,000 for Tourism as presented. In February 2017 Deputy County Executive Booth came before the Personnel and Compensation Committee to create the Tourism Director position and it was passed unanimously. There was, however, a lengthy discussion pertaining to the need for a Tourism Director as well as a need for an Economic Development Director to coordinate the county's Economic Development Program. That same day Mr. Booth attended the Education and Economic Development Committee to make the same request and the discussion continued regarding the need for the economic development professional, the motion failed. On November 30, 2017, Tourism Coordinator, Susan Hawvermale, resigned. Looking at that time up until now shows that they need both of those positions more than ever. The county is on the threshold of economic development activity, it is ready to burst and they need to be proactive. There will not be a creation of a new mechanism, it is a county position as Economic Development Director, as Tourism Director to work with the existing entities. He was in contact with the Chamber of Commerce and they were very supportive of the concept as

is the IDA. The Partnership was not as enthusiastic and embracing as he hoped for. They are adding to, not displacing. The county cannot do what the Orange County Partnership does. They are 31 years in the making and do tremendous work. The IDA does a totally different function in bringing economic development to the county. The Chamber of Commerce has been a strong partner to the county for decades. He summarized that was the request today, a Director of Tourism and a Director of Economic Development.

Mr. Gross welcomed new Legislators. One of the things they are trying to do is to create the position under the County Executive's Office. This was nothing new and in the past, there was a position called the EDZ Director, which was the Economic Development Zone Program. That program had a director based in the County Executive's Office but the position went away at the state level in 2008. What they want to do is create that position at the state level. Both positions will be divisions of the County Executive's office and will serve at the pleasure of the County Executive, whoever the County Executive may be.

Mr. Vero asked if the county will continue to use the bed tax to fund tourism as they have for the past few years and Mr. Porr confirmed that they would use the bed tax to continue to fund tourism.

Mr. Porr stated that the Legislature put the money into contingency, \$140,000 for Tourism and \$153,000 for economic development. The money they need to fund these positions exist in the current budget.

Mr. Benton asked if the Tourism Director would report to the Economic Development Director or just to the County Executive, and Mr. Gross explained that they would both report directly to the County Executive.

Mr. Booth added that they have a great opportunity to have both positions work collaboratively.

Mr. Sassi asked what is currently spent in advertising for Tourism.

Mr. Booth responded that overall it was a little over \$400,000

Mr. Sassi asked how many hotels are currently under construction and Mr. Booth responded there are seven under construction now. Mr. Sassi noted that he was supportive of the economic development but his only concern is that there is no one in that position now and he asked what happened to the Empire Zone Director.

Mr. Gross explained that the individual retired and the state did away with the program which was under Governor Pataki.

Mr. Sassi asked how this conflicted with the Partnership and Mr. Porr replied that there was no conflict, it was a joining of forces.

Mrs. Stegenga has been doing as much research on this as she could in the last 24 hours and her biggest issue is that they need someone who can represent the county and county issues. She asked if hotels would be under tourism or economic development because it is basically both so would that cause a conflict.

Mr. Booth stated that he was sure that the Economic Development Director would want to bring in more hotels and the Tourism Director will want to fill them.

Mrs. Stegenga questioned the status of Airbnbs.

Mr. Booth explained that Orange County was in the process of negotiating with Airbnb, Inc. to have them collect the occupancy tax for them. They have not come to an agreement yet. He added that he and the Finance Commissioner were working on that and it is top priority this year.

Mr. Vero pointed out that several years ago they bumped the Tourism Budget from about \$400,000 to \$1 million and that was funded by the bed tax.

Mrs. Stegenga added that this would need to be addressed because then the funding can make this more successful.

Mr. Ruskiewicz was supportive of the positions and it would be very successful to have someone here in-house to coordinate between the IDA, Partnership, Chamber of Commerce and the other entities. As Chairman of the Education and Economic Development Committee he would hope that this individual would attend the committee meeting every month to give an update on economic development.

Mr. Sassi stated that he sat on the town board in his district and he felt as though they were left out. He wanted to know how would he get his district on the map with these people.

Mr. Porr explained to Mr. Sassi that they would let the directors know, the Partnership know and the Chamber, to make it happen.

Mr. Sierra asked who was handling the Tourism Director duties and Mr. Porr responded that Mr. Booth was taking care of the duties. Mr. Sierra mentioned that in Middletown they have an Economic Director, Maria Bruni, and she has done spectacular things and the growth in Middletown has been in the newspaper and there has been so much progress. He is supportive of this and would like to work hand in hand with Tourism and it is a great opportunity to set the county ahead.

Mr. Porr pointed out that Middletown was a great example of where you see that leadership matters and he gave credit to Mayor DeStefano and Maria Bruni.

Mr. Hines asked if there was a plan to fill the Tourism Coordinator position and Mr. Booth replied that he would like to see it filled in the future. With Legoland and the other businesses coming in, the county will have a great opportunity to expand on how we draw people to Orange County and make Orange County a true destination.

Mr. Hines further asked if they thought it was possible for one person to handle both the positions and Mr. Porr responded no. It is really two different missions.

Mr. Hines explained that the way this came about was the County Executive came to the Legislature at the last Legislative session and said he wanted a Director of Tourism and they suggested to get a Director of Economic Development and now they are getting both.

Mr. Porr stated that the Tourism Director was on hold and the Legislature said to get an Economic Development Director as well.

Mr. Hines responded that he never said that and he did not hear that either. He asked where the Economic Development Director would sit and Mr. Porr replied that would be their preference.

Mr. Hines asked if there would be clerical staff hired and Mr. Porr stated that they are low on staff as it is now. Mr. Booth, himself and the County Executive share one secretary.

Mr. Hines mentioned that he saw an email that was sent today to Chairman Brescia and he was a little disappointed because the response in the email was that this is what the job description is and tasks will be assigned by the County Executive daily. He wondered if he or she will really be involved in economic development or are they doing something else.

Mr. Gross commented that a job specification is a fluid document and there is nothing set in concrete.

Mr. Hines stated that it was mentioned that this individual will work closely with the Partnership and he envisions it almost like in the police agency; the police have a case and the local police have a case and they do not communicate with each other about the details and he saw that as a problem. This can be confusing to someone who wants to bring business to Orange County and that is something that needs to be addressed. There will be confusion on who to go to first so he wants to ensure that everyone communicates and gets along. He would rather they hire only one person to handle both positions to start, see how that goes and then if they need another person in six months then come back.

Mr. Cheney asked if the Tourism position was a deputy position to the Director of Economic Development, and what grade would that position be. Mr. Gross explained that the Director of Economic Development is a Grade 26 management. They do an analysis of the position and look at other municipalities so there is quite a bit of work that aids them in determining the grade of these positions. A deputy is normally a grade below the Director.

Mr. Cheney asked why the Director of Tourism was listed at a grade 25 and Mr. Gross explained that the Economic Development position outweighs the responsibility of the Tourism Director.

Mr. Cheney asked if the Director of Tourism was to report to the Director of Economic Development as a deputy director, would that change the grade because there is less responsibility.

Mr. Gross stated that it was fair to say that was the case but they did not do that type of analysis, they were looking at creating the Director and that is the request of the County Executive. They feel that a grade 26 for the Director of Economic Development and a grade 25 for the Director of Tourism are appropriately classified and fit with the classification range with the other directors in the county.

Mr. Cheney questioned the minimum qualifications on the specifications of the job description for the Director of Tourism, it listed one year of supervisory experience. He thought that was rather inadequate.

Mr. Gross pointed out that they graduated down based on education versus experience.

Mr. Cheney mentioned the big businesses coming to Orange County such as Legoland and we already have Woodbury Commons and West Point and they become a marketing engine by themselves and that will draw more people to Orange County. He believed that the job of the Tourism Director should be to visit those popular venues and try to keep the people here for a second day, a third day and a fourth day so they can do all the other things that the county can offer.

Mr. Booth stated that was the vision they want for the Tourism Director to utilize these great opportunities.

Mr. Gross added that they just discussed with Mr. Brooks updating the Parks Master Plan; they should create an Economic Development Master Plan.

Mr. O'Donnell shared that he spent seven years as head of Economic Development for Orange County and explained why the two positions are just that, two different positions. He explained that when Mediacom came to visit with the County Executive they already had a site, they were looking for IDA benefits or whatever the County can do. He reached out to the Orange County Partnership and advised Mrs. Halahan that they do not need them for this project. He was also the Executive Director of the IDA and assured the Partnership he had it all under control, he wants for the Partnership to go out and find another Mediacom. There is a need for separation. A different type of Mediacom will come into the County Executive's office that does not need the good services of the Partnership. He added that something he wanted to bring up was Woodbury Commons and a train station there. That would be a county function and this person will be the lead on it. Woodbury Commons has been in contact with the State of New York to build a New York State Welcome Center. Woodbury Commons has already offered them 16,000 square feet but the protocol for a welcome center is 23,000 square feet. He proposed there should be a stop at Woodbury Commons and what that means to all our constituents, every town, every city, every village in the county, we increase the revenue at Woodbury Commons by 5% with a train stop from New York City. This means in taxes for every municipality, \$2 million would be the county share. When this new person is hired they will be the one who goes to meet with the MTA and gets the ball rolling. The one who gets us across the finish line is the County Executive. This is just an example of the great work that the Partnership does and what this position can do for us. He added that we answer to the citizens that we serve. The Director of Economic Development will coordinate with the six different IDAs, Orange County Partnership, Orange County Funding Corporation, Orange County Business Accelerator, New York State Economic Development and other organizations including the Orange County Water Authority which they need to work on the infrastructure for economic development. If they have the right person dedicated to economic development and this position will help the Partnership part ways with the Authority Budget Office (ABO). The ABO oversees all the IDAs, this position, the Port Authority and numerous Chambers of Commerce. The person who fills the position will be the liaison with the surrounding counties and other states and even other countries.

Mr. Paduch asked what the Partnership had to say about the position.

Mr. Porr responded that when he had the conversation with Mrs. Halahan he felt she may not have understood that this was not a displacement of her operation at all, it was joining with that entity and the county. There will come a time when everyone will be working together smoothly and efficiently.

Mr. Paduch pointed out that Mr. O'Donnell used to do this job when he worked under former County Executive Diana and now they plan to hire a separate person to do the job.

Mr. O'Donnell noted that the job occupied about 60% of his time. If he could have had County Executive Diana hire a person for the job he would have.

Mr. Paduch was concerned because he is aware of the great job that the Partnership does and bring most projects to Orange County. He mentioned that he had a list of 20 questions for the IDA that he has concerns about and has not heard back from anyone in almost four months. They asked him to go to their office and meet with them but he wants his questions and concerns to be discussed during committee so that it is public knowledge. There are a lot of people promoting economic development and they all should be working together but he does not think it will be like that if the person is working for the County Executive, he does not mean that in a mean way.

Mr. Porr stated that people of goodwill operate in the direction of what is in the best interest of the county.

Mr. Paduch mentioned that he had other questions that were submitted to Chairman Vero and Mr. Vero stated that he planned to meet with Chairman Brescia and a few others to get the answers. Mr. Paduch would like to have those answers before they confirm the individual and Mr. Vero replied that he was welcome to ask any questions.

Mr. Paduch asked Mr. Gross that the salaries are based a lot on the people that they oversee but there will only be one person in the office and they are at the highest grade and he asked why.

Mr. Gross responded it was responsibility driven and the job is not only the supervision but it has to do with the job responsibilities and the scope of the work. There is the policy influencing that will go along with this job and there will be confidentiality as a major concern for potential sites and potential developers that might come in. They will need to have that high-level proficiency to do that job and they felt that a grade 26 was the right fit.

Mr. Paduch further asked about the salary for a grade 26. He added that there are positions that get filled with the people making a very high salary almost at the cap which is already a concern because those individuals get a stipend at the end of the year. He asked why would we hire someone at such a high salary so close to the cap. He asked what the salary would be for this person.

Mr. Booth explained that it all depends on the quality of the experience the person has. He pointed out that they do not have anyone in mind for the position, they are just creating it for now.

Mr. Porr added that when they approve the position they approve the salary range.

Mrs. Stegenga stated that the specifications for the job were in draft form and wanted to know if they would get a final copy. She noted that in the description for the Director of Economic Development there were three pages of experience the individual would have to have but it says under Minimum Qualifications, "Any combination of training and experience acceptable to the County Executive." She thought that the individual would need at least a bachelor's degree.

Mr. Gross explained that the positions are to serve at the pleasure of the County Executive and the minimum qualifications are in place because every position is created competitively until they petition the state and make it a different class, so they need detailed minimum qualifications but the reality is once it is approved the County Executive will choose based on who he or she feels is best for the position.

Mr. Benton stated that he would have been happier if the documents contained what they regularly do which is eliminate a position when they create a position. To eliminate the coordinator's position would have been ideal since it is not a necessary position anymore.

Mr. Sierra confirmed that they were requesting to create two positions; the Director and Assistant and Mr. Porr confirmed he was correct. He added that when there are so many entities contributing and not one person to directly spearhead it you will run into problems. He is a firm believer that when you have the right candidate it can really make or break your municipality. There are a lot of projects going on now and water is a big issue and Amy's Kitchen collaborated with Middletown to make that happen. You cannot create large projects like this if you do not have the proper resources such as sewer, water or manpower. When you create a position like this something that you get is the ability to hold someone responsible.

Chairman Brescia concurred with Legislator O'Donnell the need for this position. In 2016 the County Executive approached the subject and so did Legislator O'Donnell and then in 2017 they allocated money in the budget because they were not going to fund the Partnership anymore because of the ABO noncompliance which is their choice. He would not support this position at all if he thought it would be competition for the Partnership. They will work hand in hand. Mediacom came through the County Executive's office and he did a fantastic job. There are other companies that do not want to go through the County Executive, some would rather go through the IDA and each agency complements each other. The County Executive has been overwhelmed over the last few years and he is the reason why Amy's Kitchen is here and why we lured Legoland. He feels there is a need for the position and he would like the email he forwarded from the Chamber of Commerce to be incorporated into this. (On file with Clerk of the Legislature). He added that the Director of Economic Development should be confirmed by the Legislature. That individual will serve at the pleasure of the County Executive but we have a lot of questions. If this does not do what we want it to do, we can defund the position. He noted that he felt that the Director of Economic Development should attend the Education and Economic Development meetings at least every other month, more so than the IDA or Partnership.

Mr. Gross thanked Chairman Brescia for his email and noted the amended job specifications that were handed out.

Mr. Benton noted the great relationship with the Partnership but it was no secret that the funding has gone down in recent years but with their fundraising they do not need county funds. Now they are not able to accept the funds with that extra oversight but they have always been upfront with telling us that it's been nice working together but the funding was not necessary.

Mr. Porr added that the Partnership is solid and we do not do what they can do.

Mr. Sierra was not sure if the position would warrant a deputy to the Director of Economic Development but he would like to see the Tourism Director fall under the Director of Economic Development but he was not sure of the workload. He recalled Mr. O'Donnell stating 60% of his day was dedicated to the work.

Mr. Porr stated that both positions fall under the County Executive with direct supervision so one would not oversee the other.

Mr. Sierra mentioned that the reason he asked was because the Economic Development Director in Middletown oversees quite a bit and there is a chain of command.

Mr. Porr stated that the chain of command is that the County Executive directs both.

Mr. Faggione thanked Mr. O'Donnell for his presentation and reiterated what he said; we answer to the taxpayers. All the discussion before them today about these positions and answering to the County Executive would of course be by default in the machinery of government but these positions answer to the voters. He shared that he has a background in small business and lives in western Orange County which for the most part is a quaint little part of the county. They rely on tourism in the summer and fall time. He may only be three years in and not necessarily know the machinery of government, but Mr. Porr and Mr. O'Donnell are correct, that list of agencies that they reach out to can be intimidating as to who do they call for this or that or who do I speak to about opening a small business in Deerpark. When you get responses from these different agencies it can make your head spin. He was supportive of the two positions and felt they would add growth to the community.

Mr. Paduch asked if there was a new business opening in his district that is looking for guidance, who should he refer them to because in the past he would refer these people to the Partnership or to the County Executive's office and let them handle it.

Mr. Booth suggested it can be either or. Their goal is to work together with the Partnership, the IDA and the Chamber of Commerce. It would be based on whatever services are needed, if they do not need location services then they would not go to the Partnership but if they wanted to partner with other businesses then they would send them to the Chamber of Commerce or if they needed job training they would refer them to Steve Knob.

Chairman Brescia asked if anyone agreed with him about the Legislature confirming the position.

Mrs. Reed stated that she would need to research it because some of the positions, by Charter, require that they be appointed and confirmed by the Legislature but this position is not in the Charter, it is a new position.

Chairman Brescia asked if they would have that answer before it gets voted on by the full Legislature and Mrs. Reed confirmed they would.

Mr. Hines asked if the position was called Commissioner of Economic Development then would that require the confirmation and Mrs. Reed noted that it was not set forth in the Charter.

Mr. O'Donnell pointed out that this is something that could be done in the future, if it is not in the Charter they can put it in but it can be addressed later and that is not something that should hold up the position.

Motion carried. All in favor.

Mrs. Stegenga moved the request to create one Director of Economic Development, Management Grade 26, seconded by Mr. Faggione.

Mr. Vero stated that they have been discussing this along with the Director of Tourism and asked if there were any additional comments. Seeing none he called for roll call.

Motion carried. All in favor.

Mr. Sierra moved the request to create one (1) Senior Secretary and Administrative Assistant, Grade 10, seconded by Mrs. Stegenga.

Mr. Gross explained that it was a standard position, it is clerical support, grade 10, step 2 which falls under the CSEA schedule. The hourly rate is \$22.44 and an annual salary of \$40,853.

There were comments on the need for this position if the other one did not pass and it was explained that if it failed on the floor then they could pull it.

Motion carried. All in favor.

Mr. Faggione moved the request to transfer \$140,000 from contingency to Tourism for costs associated with the Director of Tourism position, seconded by Mrs. Stegenga.

Mr. Benton stated that the discussion during budget time was instead of eliminating the funds from the budget process, they simply moved them into contingency so they knew they can act when they wanted to this year.

Motion carried. All in favor.

Mr. Benton moved the request to transfer \$153,000 from contingency to County Executive for costs associated with the new position Director of Economic Development and Senior Secretary and Administrative Assistant, seconded by Mrs. Stegenga.

Motion carried. All in favor.

Mr. Vero concluded the meeting by welcoming back former Legislators to the committee, additional Legislators and the newly elected Legislators and noted that he looked forward to a good year.

On the motion of Mr. Ruskiewicz, seconded by Mrs. Stegenga, the meeting adjourned at 4:59 p.m.