

Meeting Minutes
Planning Committee Meeting
September 20, 2023 at 10:00 AM

Legislative Statutory Committee Room
OC Government Center
255 Main Street, Goshen, NY

Join Zoom Meeting Link:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/81970952090?pwd=UGtRb3d5YXg3eTdNZ3dEWHpBcDc2Zz09>

Dial-in Number: (646) 876-9923

Meeting ID: 819 7095 2090

Passcode: 748595

Previous Policy Board Meeting Recordings Link:

https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLTwjp62_3OioTvLPGLF7YEmpzdJW4_j8C

Meeting Participants (In-Person)

| Name: | Organization: |
|-----------------|--|
| Alan Sorensen | Orange County Department of Planning |
| Stacy Butler | Orange County Department of Planning |
| Lauren Bennett | Orange County Department of Planning |
| Raina Tawil | Orange County Department of Planning |
| Sandra Jobson | NYS Department of Transportation, Region 8 |
| Charles Carnes | Town of Crawford |
| Michael Sweeton | Town of Warwick |
| Scott Manley | Town of Newburgh |
| Jacob Tawil | City of Middletown |
| Jason Morris | City of Newburgh |
| John Revella | Village of Walden |
| Anthony Cardone | Town of Monroe |
| Gary Spears | Town of Deerpark |
| Laura Ripley | NYS Thruway Authority |
| Michael Weeks | MHE, Rep. City of Port Jervis |

Meeting Participants (Virtual)

| | |
|-------------------|--|
| Rob Parrington | Orange County Department of Planning, rep. Orange County Transit Operators |
| Ryan McGuire | Orange County Department of Public Works |
| Travis Ewald | Orange County Department of Parks & Recreation |
| Alexandra Fairley | NYS Department of Transportation |
| Jay Shuffield | Port Authority of New York & New Jersey (PANYNJ) |
| Lisa Cataldo | NYS Department of Transportation, Main Office |
| Ali Mohseni | Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee (TCC) |
| Michael Amabile | Creighton Manning |

| | |
|-------------------|--|
| Joshua Wojehowski | Town of Cornwall |
| Lance MacMillan | NYS Department of Transportation, Main Office |
| David Lake | Mid-Hudson South Transportation Coordinating Committee (TCC) |
| Gedalye Szegedin | Village of Kiryas Joel |
| David Gilmour | AICP, Laberge Group |

Call to Order

Mr. Alan Sorensen called this meeting to order.

Introductions

Introductions were made from 0:00:11.230 through 0:02:26.170.

Call for Citizen Participation

0:02:27.900,0:02:48.540

Alan Sorensen: I'd like to next move on to Call for Citizen Participation. Are there any comments from the public either anyone here in person, or online?

Let's give it 30 seconds.

0:02:48.600,0:02:50.460

None

Approval of Meeting Minutes – August 15, 2023

0:02:50.820,0:03:09.080

Alan Sorensen: Alright, hearing no public comments, I will move on to ask for the Committee to ask for Approval of the Minutes from our August 15th, 2023 meeting. Everyone had an opportunity through the transcript, any comments recommendations for revisions?

0:03:12.560,0:03:15.080

None

0:03:15.080,0:03:22.200

Alan Sorensen: Ok. With that, I'll ask for a motion to approve the meeting minutes-

0:03:22.200,0:03:23.200

Michael Sweeton: *Motion*

0:03:23.200,0:03:24.200

Alan Sorensen: Mike-

0:03:24.200,0:03:26.200

Jacob Tawil: I'll second.

0:03:26.220,0:03:29.640

Alan Sorensen: All those in favor?

0:03:29.640,0:03:30.140

All: Aye.

0:03:30.640,0:03:31.532

Alan Sorensen: Anyone opposed?

0:03:31.532,0:03:33.532

Tony Cardone: I abstain from the vote.

0:03:33.532,0:03:36.760

Alan Sorensen: Tony, thank you.

0:03:36.760,0:03:38.640

Tony Cardone: Yep.

Communications & Announcements

0:03:38.640,0:04:08.160

Alan Sorensen: Next, we'll go on to Communications and Announcements. The first is New York State DOT will be holding public informational Open House for PIN 8002.24, New York Route 94/17A Improvement Project. And that will be on October 19th, 2023, at 6 p.m. at the Village Hall in the Village of Florida.

Please reach out if you have any questions or need additional information and we can get you in contact with the project engineer.

Reports & Actions on Old Business

Reports

0:04:14.040,0:04:28.720

Alan Sorensen: So, moving on to Reports and Actions on Old Business.

And in terms of project updates, Lauren, will you give us an update on the Long-Range Transportation Plan?

OCTC Staff Reports

0:04:28.720,0:05:53.340

Lauren Bennett: Yes, so since the last OCTC meeting, we've held the second public meeting for the LRTP- the Long-Range Transportation Plan, which we're looking at 2050 Horizon Year. And that was on August 15th, we held that in Middletown; and then the third Public Outreach meeting, they held in Sugarloaf on August 24th. So, that concludes the public meetings for the Long-Range Transportation Plan update. There are still opportunities to comment and be involved, so that will introduce the draft LRTP to the Planning Committee next meeting on October 24th and that will be an opportunity to discuss, and then we will look we'll go up to the 30-day... 30-day public comment period with tentative adoption on November 28th at the November Policy Board meeting.

And then, we'll also look to hold one final Advisory Group meeting and we'll be sharing the draft version of that soon hopefully, with those members. We'll ask for comments before it goes out to

the public with the meeting materials for that October 24th meeting. Alan, did you want to say anything?

0:05:53.340,0:06:16.380

Alan Sorensen: I want to thank the members who have been serving on the study Advisory Group for your participation. We'll be doing an internal staff-level review of the draft LRTP that is being provided by our consulting team, after which we'll get it on to the Council members, for your review.

0:06:18.420,0:06:28.380

Alan Sorensen: Next item is the Coordinated Plan, which is in its final draft. And Lauren or Stacy, anything you want to add to that?

0:06:30.120,0:06:36.240

Lauren Bennett: We'll just be...we'll introduce it at the October meeting as well- just an update- and then we'll be asking members to adopt that on the November 28th Policy Board meeting.

2020 FHWA Urban Area Boundary Adjustments

0:06:41.440,0:07:37.020

Alan Sorensen: Ok. Moving along, we have the 2020 FHWA Urban Area Boundary Adjustments. We've talked about this at previous meetings- so New York State DOT is creating a URL for the online map to view the 'Proposed' Urban Area Boundary Adjustments; the Transportation Council is asked to review/engage effective local municipalities and provide an email supporting the adjusted Urban Areas, or it can take a formal action and adopt a resolution formally supporting the adjustments. So, [we're] here just really to ask for the Council's guidance- whether the preference would be to do formal resolution or whether we can simply respond by email supporting the trusted Urban Area?

0:07:40.320,0:07:50.880

Jacob Tawil: I don't know sorry to sound ignorant but what impact would that have on us the adjustment of any boundaries?

0:07:54.240,0:08:35.940

Alan Sorensen: I don't think it will have an impact; we added...we recommended adding an area- I'm sorry for the people online, I'm not going to be able... you won't see what I'm doing. I believe we added this area in here because of the several warehouses proposed- it's off of 17M, South of 17M is a big RDM warehouse proposed in there, so that was like, our one adjustment, but it's pretty much, I don't know, Stacy, anything you would add?

0:08:36.600,0:08:47.520

Scott Manley: When you say DOT, do you mean just more opportunities for them to upgrade the roads or fix the roads?

0:08:49.860,0:08:54.720

Alan Sorensen: It's not so much that like with those areas that are in the Urban Boundaries are eligible for the Highway funding.

0:09:02.760,0:09:11.640

Alan Sorensen: Yeah, yeah.

0:09:11.640,0:09:33.120

Stacy Butler: It really impacts the minor collectors whether they're rural or Urban, which none of them should be impacted with this latest draft. And this is also, just to be clear -it's not the same as FTA uses. They use the actual Census Boundary- it's not the adjusted Boundaries, this is just FHWA funding.

0:09:35.940,0:10:10.740

Lauren Bennett: I guess as a reminder because we had introduced these at the August 15th meeting so, like Alan said, this is almost exactly what it was in 2010- the Adjusted Areas- it was.... we just added, as Alan said, the area right here. *Motions* So these roads will now be included and eligible for Urban funding. And then just the areas that were extended out in Port Jervis but otherwise, no areas were taken out of the Boundaries. So, if you are eligible in 2010, you'll still be eligible under 2020.

0:10:18.360,0:10:19:030

Alan Sorensen: Any other questions?

0:10:19:030,0:10:20:500

All: *None*

0:10:20.520,0:10:21.520

Alan Sorensen: Ok, I think we're good.

0:10:22.520,0:10:26.280

Lauren Bennett: Ok, so we're supporting via email? Is that ok? Or resolution?

0:10:26.280,0:10:28.800

Jacob Tawil: It's [email] ok with me.

0:10:28.800,0:10:30.280

Michael Sweeton: Support.

0:10:30.280,0:10:35.780

Alan Sorensen: Alright thank you. We will get that email out.

Village of Kiryas Joel Bus Request Discussion

0:10:37.800,0:10:49.500

Alan Sorensen: I'm going to skip over to the next item on the Agenda- Kiryas Joel's Bus Request discussion- Gedalye asked if we could hold off till 10:30(AM) when he'll be able to join the call;

0:36:58.380,0:37:10.440

Gedalye Szegedin: Hello. Hello, hello. Thank you everybody for waiting, appreciate it deeply.

0:37:10.440,0:37:24.660

Alan Sorensen: Oh, you're welcome.

So, I wanted to afford you an opportunity to talk a little bit about Kiryas Joel's bus request and then we can have a little discussion on that,

0:37:26.940,0:37:35.640

Gedalye Szegedin: So, thank you. We already had a a detailed discussion at the first meeting and everybody had an opportunity to read the letter that we outlined in detail: the growth in the program. And I also had a chance to read the meeting afterwards where Bob Parrington so eloquently described the situation. I was away in Israel for that meeting so I wasn't able to join in person. And some of the points that Bob made was that that the fact that the ridership is increasing; Kiryas Joel is actually benefiting the County coffers in general because, funding is coming in based on ridership and since this is part of the County program, if the County could show a couple 100,000 more Riders using the mass transit system everybody's benefiting through the Federal formula that's coming into the county and additional buses is only going to help increase those numbers so looking at it from a from a financial impact the more buses in Kiryas Joel, the more Riders the more funding coming to Orange County, that's being distributed to all the providers. Those are points that I haven't made in the letter, points that I have made, is... the status on the ground and the trenches when buses are having to leave stops without picking up everybody because the bus is jam-packed and, and the tremendous growth we had one-week last week. And again, this is not a normal week. It's the week before school, so people go for preschool shopping and all that. But we hit 26K passengers in a single week. If that were the norm, that would be over a million Riders a year. Now we understand this is a peak and it's not meant to be the standard but again this month we hit 98K passengers for the month. And again, this is a peak amount it's before the Jewish holidays, before school is opening; people going out, doing lots and lots of shopping, the weather was beautiful, and it definitely translated into the numbers. But we cannot serve 100,000 people safely with the amount of buses we have. And, we're leaving a lot of people without serving them. In addition, buses are riding jam-packed with standing people and you're dealing with carriages and twin carriages, kids, babies, some I'm replaying what we wrote in the letter- what I've made the plea in the opening meeting and relying on that... the plea is detailed enough.

I'm opening myself for questions that people may have, I don't want to reiterate everything we have written and said before. We want to give people an opportunity to have a discussion and a dialogue at the last meetings we also talked about expanding the Middletown service and other services within the County we are very much pro-mass transit: getting cars off the road getting people to places where they need to go by mass transit and we're team players when it comes to

providing these services but this is a round that Kiryas Joel needs everybody's help in and making sure the mass transit system works again getting cars off the road getting taxes off the roads, and programming people to use mass transit and, when the opportunity arises and other communities have needs, of course we will be a participant in providing for those needs as well.

So, with that if people have questions or discussions of course, as Rob knows, everyone's system and all the numbers and we're working very closely with the County Department of Planning on making sure that we find all the property ports with the County, with the State, with the Federal, so everybody- every passenger is counted, and every passenger brings a return to the county overall. So any discussion any questions, I'm here to answer Alan.

0:42:57.480,0:43:30.343

Alan Sorensen: Thank you. I just want to say that, you know, Rob and I do keep an eye on what's happening in each of the communities. There clearly is, you know, a need here for additional buses. I know that, you know, you've had your engineers, you know, provide some analysis of the needs. Rob, I see you're on- Rob can you add a little bit to the discussion before we go to questions of the board members?

0:43:30.343,0:43:41.880

Gedalye Szegedin: So, let me.... let me just respond to the point you just read and of course, I let Bob respond. When we started seeing this...this tremendous growth, we immediately realized that we were going to need some help. We consulted with Rob on some names who could help us fill out all the reports, making sure that we're not missing the person, and one of the names that we received is the firm Creighton Manning. We contracted with Creighton Manning for doing the reports, but we also contracted with Creighton Manning for doing a system analysis- the current Fleet we have, how we could best run the route, what improvements we need to have, how many buses we should be working for. Some of the reports on the current Fleet, we've gotten feedback but um, on future growth analysis statistics, we have not gotten that far yet uh because as you see, that a lot of it is off the chart and it's some sort of 'you buy the buses, they'll come,' and everybody wants them to come so because the more mass transit. The less cars, the less other methods of vehicles, and it's better for the environment, it's better for safety, it's better for convenience. And that's why [the] mass transit system is important. So, I don't have everything that you would want to see in a comprehensive study as of now, but we do have the charts and the numbers and the growth rate. At this point, they're trying to tweak some of the... routes. And, also there is a lot of discussion whether or not we should continue with fixed-route, plus Dial-A-Ride, or we should incorporate the Dial-A-Ride into more fixed-route services, instead of having like one-on-one. So uh, we are using some of the buses from Dial-A-Ride, for fixed-route when there's breakdowns. And of course, those are not meant for carriages and for heavy uses, but that's the best we have at this point. But uh, we are working on a comprehensive analysis...hopefully next few months.

0:46:17.820,0:46:24.660

Rob Parrington: I was I their numbers are phenomenal you know - 100K [passengers] in a month is crazy. If you look at Newburgh does maybe 130K [Riders] in a year, you know. There's obviously a lot of ridership there. I know, I would also be really interested to see what Creighton Manning has, or it does come up with you know, that obviously adds more backup to this story or tells more of the story but the...it's some incredible numbers, you know, coming out of Kiryas Joel honestly right now.

0:46:51.420,0:46:56.880

Mike Sweeton: So Gedalye, thank you. I think one of the issues we looked at the letter, at least my Dial-A-Ride service looked at the letter, is the concern about duplication of service. I'm pleased to hear that you've engaged Creighton Manning to do this study. It would be helpful I think for all of us to understand. I believe buses should be where people are going to use them, so that that makes sense to me. We just want to make sure that we're doing it efficiently, I think.

0:47:2.200,0:47:27.060

Gedalye Szegedin: Having an opportunity now to speak to multiple municipal leaders even if these 10 buses are approved and we are hopeful it would be it still has to go through a purchase process in a manufacturing process. If anybody has buses sitting around without being used and could lend us those buses or lease us those buses for the duration that these 10 buses would arrive I'm putting in a formal plea uh if you have any buses sitting around that is in usable form that we could incorporate into our system for a year...and a half until these buses arrive that would be greatly appreciated and that goes to your point not having buses sit around but having buses serve the people.

0:48:18.420,0:49:22.680

Anthony Cardone: So, I am the one that sent the email to the Orange County transportation Council and asked for further information on this, I sent it to some of the members here. You know, in my mind I want to see the numbers. I know for sure that Newburgh's lacking. I know that City of Middletown has limited hours. I hear complaints over at Walden, I hear complaints from Montgomery Dial-A-Bus, so I think it's uh maybe Gedalye obviously needs some buses, but I believe a study should be done as far as the whole County goes, I think there are other places that that need um buses too so whether or not Gedalye needs 10 buses I don't know I'd like to see Creighton Manning's report. I also would like uh Gedalye mentions, it brings in more money. I want to see the- yes more money might come in- but I'd like to see the amount of money comes in versus the bus cost because if 'x' comes in but the buses are three times 'x' you know, then maybe-

0:49:22.680,0:49:38.280

Gedalye Szegedin: We could definitely ask the county to share the numbers that we're submitting on a monthly basis for Kiryas Joel, and I want to pitch very strongly that people shouldn't be viewing this, that there is a pot of 10 buses and Kiryas Joel wants it all- nobody has established that to be the case. We are going by... the understanding that anybody that has a need for buses, and could show the need and prove the need, should be getting buses. So, it's not either us or someone else- and we're hopeful that we're not taking away anybody else's buses and it shouldn't be viewed in that light. Anybody that's making a case for buses, anybody that's making a case for buses should make the case and have it stand on its own merits. And if the merits are there, the buses should be delivered.

0:50:22.040,0:51:01.320

Alan Sorensen: I just want to echo Gedalye's statement there, I'm very confident, we have sufficient funding to provide the Capital investment for Middletown, Newburgh, Kiryas Joel and other communities that have needs, that funding is there. And actually, the resolutions that you'll be acting on soon, where we're reallocating you know, some of the TMA money- CRRSAA and ARPA funding- for operating will free up even further dollars for us.

0:51:01.320,0:51:26.900

Tony Cardone: But you're saying there's money there for Middletown- I believe stops at five o'clock- I believe, you know, I believe Newburgh is limited- I'm not a pro on Newburgh - I know for sure people complaints for the Town of Montgomery-Crawford Dial-A-Bus are coming in. So, you're telling me there's if they were to get in touch with you there's enough money for Gedayle's 10 buses- *if* they're needed, once we see the surveys and how they calculated the numbers- and these other towns might need them you're saying there's enough money for those?

0:51:27.000,0:51:28.600

Alan Sorensen: Yes, there is.

0:51:28.600,0:51:29.900

Tony Cardone: Ok, there is? Ok, I'd like to see that.

0:51:30.900,0:53:39.300

Gedalye Szegedin: I want to ask, and you repeated a few times that you want to see the numbers...the numbers are outlined in the letter that we submitted. We could share right now, the charts of the last four (4) years of numbers. The numbers are there, Creighton Manning is not going to have their overall analysis because their analysis deals with fare-collection upgrades, it deals with bus stop upgrades, it deals with bus shelters, it is with routes, it deals with so many other things; I would beg you very strongly that since the numbers are out there, and we have a transparently submitted numbers for the last five (5) years on a monthly basis to the County and it's in everybody's possession, or it could be in everybody's possession, that that those numbers speak already on itself, so loud. And stands on its own legs that waiting for anything beyond those numbers...I will provide that when it becomes available- it's a couple of months away. We've submitted this request already, a couple of months ago. It would be grossly unfair for us to have to wait for a vote for action when the numbers are there, but we just don't have a study but Craig Manning and by the way it's not a study that the county has ever requested of us or that we were mandated to do. It's a study that we're doing voluntary, and I will share voluntary the results of that study. But please, don't make us wait for the buses until that study is out. There... the number speaks for themselves, the numbers are out there, everybody could see it. My letter is out there, for a couple of months please don't delay this vote.

0:53:40.200,0:53:48.960

Alan Sorensen: What I would like to offer is the... we ran the numbers, internally. I think we ran it for six (6) buses; Rob was it six for replacement buses for KJ? Seven (7)?

0:54:00.360,0:54:45.300

Rob Parrington: Right, we already have three (3) buses; we have... we have funding for three (3) buses already in Grants leftover grants that would be available, so we only have to add seven (7), like new to the TIP. But I'd like to point out- just go back for a second- that one of the TIP actions, the Council should know, and I mentioned this I believe the last meeting as well, that one of the TIP actions today includes the three (3) additional buses at Middletown, for the Middletown service. That's coming out of the recommended upgrade to the service, the changes to the service, so that their Fleet will double in size, [and] so we can expand the hours and expand the service to Middletown. One of the TIP actions today includes those three (3) additional buses.

0:54:46.860,0:56:10.440

Tony Cardone: I really would like some clarification on the Dial-A-Ride agreement because there's a percentage of those riders that are being picked up in the town of Monroe and taken back into KJ the way I read the agreement that's not allowed unless there's an IMA with the municipalities-number one. Number two- the agreement, from what I understand, states that if a village, in a town-meaning the same Village, meaning the villages in the town has a Dial-A-Ride program- that they're allowed to go 1-mile outside their village boundaries to pick up in their Town, not in another town. I don't... you know, I'm going to say that we've had multiple issues with the buses coming from Kiryas Joel into the Town of Monroe, one of them being: they're numbered the same in some instances. And I believe their numbers are in the 30s and ours- we've gotten calls that you know, the driver cut this person off, or you know, he was driving a little recklessly, or he was on the phone. And you know, I have to deal with that now.

0:56:11.220,0:56:13.120

Alan Sorensen: Understood. I am going to turn to Rob-

0:56:13.120,0:58:13.600

Gedalye Szegedin: But let me respond for a moment. We are part of...what we're contemplating now is doing away with the entire Dial-A-Ride program and incorporate everything into the fixed-route. The numbers that we have shared with the county shows that even though the amount of Riders on the dialer ride is high, from a County's perspective but in comparison to the fixed-route, it's extremely low. It's... what is it, the couple percent of the total, and the way Creighton Manning looks at it right now, is providing routes within the Village, and then mini routes, with the idea of people transferring buses from one to another. That may...the Dial-A-Ride buses may be implemented as part of those mini-routes, all running within the Kiryas Joel boundaries, and not having to leave Kiryas Joel again.

This is a couple of months down; we don't know yet for sure but of course, the numbering is a no-brainer. If that's an issue? And I would let the County coordinate that but I would be very open to re-numbering buses, if there is any confusion. I don't mind having different design on buses if there is any confusion on the issue of leaving Kiryas Joel. We went through this before with the County, and the County showed us the citation within the State regs, that shows how far a bus system could leave outside its municipality, and we're strictly enforcing that measurements-

0:58:13.600,0:58:17.000

Tony Cardone: That's with an IMA, Gedalye. You do not have an IMA.

0:58:17.040,0:58:32.460

Gedalye Szegedin: I wasn't aware that with an IMA, but I let the County advise us on that. And whatever the County says- that goes. So, if the County would look into that chapter of the regulation and tell us that it's one-mile with an IMA, then it's one-mile with an IMA. We want to be 100% squarely within the regulations.

0:58:40.440,0:58:55.380

Alan Sorensen: It sounds... it sounds to me that Rob and I need to do a little research internally and then we will reach out Tony- we'll reach out to you -we'll reach out to Gedalye if we have to. I want to get the issue resolved.

0:58:55.380,0:58:57.380

Gedalye Szegedin: Yes, absolutely.

0:58:57.380,0:58:59.900

Alan Sorensen: It is my wish to do that.

0:59:00.380,0:59:26.160

Gedalye Szegedin: So, I wasn't aware that this is... I wasn't aware that this is an issue in front of the town I know when the Town of Palm Tree split away from the Town of Monroe, this was an issue like the first few months and I have to say that I thought it was resolved with the County's clarification, but if it's not- I'm very open to whatever the County will advise us to do, based on the regulations.

0:59:26.820,0:59:40.860

Alan Sorensen: Ok. Yeah, it's from my perspective - I want to make sure we're in full compliance with the regs, so we will research this, and we'll Rob and I will be back in touch with Gedalye and Tony.

0:59:40.860,0:59:57.480

Mike Sweeton: So, refocus on the issue right, so there's- Charlie's right- So there's buses allocated for Newburgh, Middletown - I'm looking at this amendment -and KJ, right? It's not affecting operating for our systems.

0:59:57.480,0:59:58.800

Alan Sorensen: No.

0:59:58.800,1:00:05.920

Mike Sweeton: And there's adequate money to give if Crawford ends up needing more buses or whatever it is-

1:00:05.920, 1:00:07.020

Tony Cardone: It's Crawford/Montgomery.

1:00:08.000,1:00:11.040

Mike Sweeton: Right, whatever it is, there's money there- is that what we're hearing from Alan, right?

1:00:11.040,1:00:12.820

Tony Cardone: That's what Alan told us-

1:00:13.040,1:00:15.550

Alan Sorensen: No, it is there, it's there.

1:00:16.040,1:00:20.080

Mike Sweeton: So again, in the spirit of getting more buses, instead of getting hold up in purchasing buses-

1:00:20.080, 1:00:26.480

Tony Cardone: No, but we have not come up with a number there- we came up with ten (10), you came up with seven (7)?

1:00:26.480,1:00:29:080

Alan Sorensen: Yeah.

1:00:29:080,1:00:32.080

Tony Cardone: Because they had money for the other three (3).

1:00:32.080, 1:00:35.480

Mike Sweeton: And I think there's (13) buses on the...this TIP Amendment. Is that correct, Lauren?

1:00:37.440,1:00:41.880

Raina Tawil: Is it the one I am pulling up right now, Mike?

1:00:41.880,1:00:48.080

Mike Sweeton: Let me see, 23-04, is that the one we're going to vote on?

1:00:48.080,1:00:50.940

Lauren Bennett: Yes, 16-passenger buses.

1:00:51.660,1:01:03.480

Rob Parrington: None of those buses have anything to do with the request for additional by Kiyas Joel, they're all replacement buses minus the three (3) additional buses for Middletown, just so people are clear.

1:01:04.200,1:01:32.820

Alan Sorensen: Right and we would propose to come back... we could come back in October with a proposed response to Kiyas Joel's request, so you could actually see it in a TIP Amendment- you'll see the dollars. And then Rob can also... Rob and I and Martha will go through the numbers so I can tell you how much money we still have available after making these purchases.

1:01:32.820,1:01:45.260

Michael Weeks: And I'd like Rob to show me how that ridership is calculated- do we bring somebody, we drop them off, they get back up how do we how do we do in those counts and make sure there's no duplication in counts.

1:01:46.260,1:01:49.320

Alan Sorensen: Okay, Rob you make a note of that?

1:01:49.320,1:01:52.320

Rob Parrington: Yeah, every time someone pays a fare, they get countered.

1:01:54.000,1:02:01.380

Alan Sorensen: This is a healthy discussion yeah.

1:02:01.380,1:02:47.340

Gedalye Szedgen: But I also want that in mind I also want to remind the committee that a while back when \$18M was allocated to build this Schunnemunk Trail, which came from the similar pot to where buses are bought, and I raised the issue at the time that we're voting for \$18M for the Schunnemunk Trail, but it's money that's allocated for transit buses- is it going to be impacting the transit buses Kiryas Joel will be needing additional buses. And everybody at the time committed that it's not going to be impacting the buses, and we all voted in support of that. So it's time to honor the second part of the deal

1:02:47.340,1:03:06.600

Alan Sorensen: I, you know, I would just add with Schunnemunk, among the other things, we were running up against is, you know, if we're not spending this funding, we run the risk of funding lapsing. And so, that was the other advantage of having the Schunnemunk project is: we captured those funds that would have lapsed and then no one you know, within the Council, would have you know benefited from this fund.

1:03:12.120,1:03:30.480

Gedalye Szedgen: And that's the point I'm making clear all the time; if one project isn't competing with another- isn't pushing out another- then it should be reviewed on the merits. If it's pushing out somebody else, then it has to be weighed much more carefully.

1:03:30.480,1:03:35.280

Alan Sorensen: Yeah. Right now we're in a comfortable position where we can accommodate both, and that's what we're looking to do.

1:03:35.280,1:03:36.200

Gedalye Szedgen: Thank you.

1:03:36.280,1:03:41.040

Alan Sorensen: And have a more robust transportation system that offers more choices.

1:03:41.040,1:03:53.070

Gedalye Szedgen: Thank you.

1:03:45.500,1:03:52.260

Alan Sorensen: With that, is there any other any other discussion, comments?

1:03:53.340,1:04:00.060

Scott Manley: I just got a quick question, I know Middletown, based on what the newest Study, you're getting three (3) new ones. Newburgh is still in the middle of the study- say they show that they need three (3) more, we're still good?

1:04:00.060,1:04:23.900

Alan Sorensen: Yeah oh, we're still good. Yes, yeah and you have to keep in mind that you know as we're expanding the services, theoretically there'll be a corresponding increase in ridership and so that also translates into additional funding.

1:04:24.980,1:04:32.640

Scott Manley: Instead of the city of Middletown and Newburgh you know once they tackle what hours/ where we're going- the whole goal is to update the ridership along with KJ?

1:04:32.640,1:04:54.060

Alan Sorensen: We want to have a system that's responsive to the needs of the community. So...if someone needs you know if they're if they're working 9a-5p, and the bus stops- they try, but they still need to go shopping for their family you know we need the hours to be extended for that purpose and saying if someone's working you know, if they're able to get to work but there's no ride home?

1:04:54.060,1:04:59.340

Scott Manley: That's my problem in Newburgh. I got lots of jobs, no transportation.

1:04:59.340, 1:05:40.860

Alan Sorensen: Yeah, right. Trying to resolve that with these studies. It isn't that there's not enough for everybody, I think there is. And you know we have in the docket- and I want to assume that, Mike, it is. If we weren't so short-staffed, we would have been working on an RFP for County-Wide Transit Feasibility [of] Services study. That's something that's in our UPWP, the funding is there, we just- at the moment -can't get that one off the ground but it's I do promise you that, that's something that will be moving forward with, someday.

With that, if there's no further conversation, I'll ask for a motion to adjourn.

1:05:43.680,1:05:57.240

Gedalye Szedgen: Before you vote on a motion to adjourn uh may I ask for a vote on the 10 buses today. Do it in the holiday spirit.

Laughter

1:05:59.220,1:06:09.660

Alan Sorensen: Gedalye what I'd um what I could offer is, we'll have a TIP Amendment prepared for the October meeting uh to bring before the Board, and we'll circulate it uh well in advance of that with the intent of being able we'll do a back-to-back meeting in October so that we could take action.

1:06:28.380,1:07:11.40

Gedalye Szedgen: But I want to make but I want to make sure since you're voting on some buses today and I know Rob is very diligent, he's going to start the process of purchasing buses he's going to start the process of manufacturing buses I want to be able to manufacture and do the procurement process together instead of having to wait for a separate procurement process so either Rob is going to hold off on procurement on the buses that you are voting today or we have-

I want to be in one large procurement, it makes more economic sense when the County has 10 additional buses as part of the bidding or RFP package-

1:07:11.400,1:07:44.040

Rob Parrington: So, we are looking ahead at that separately. We're working on the procurement of buses that will allow us the opportunity to get as many buses as we need, we're hoping to piggyback, opportunity will work for us like it has in the past where we can join another bid where there's no limit as to how many buses we can get off of that bid we plan ahead to make sure if we do go to bid ourselves, we will make sure that we have enough options built in so that we are ahead of the game, as much as we can be.

1:07:44.340,1:07:48.120

Gedalye Szedgen: Thank you, always thank you.

1:07:50.040,1:07:55.700,1:08:02.100

Alan Sorensen: What do we need to do in advance?

1:07:55.700,1:08:02.100

Lauren Bennett: We could introduce it in October, we just couldn't take action and adopt in October. November, because it does need that public comment period.

1:08:02.100,1:08:12.240

Alan Sorensen: Okay so Gedalye we would... the recommendation is, we would introduce the amendment for your additional ten (10) buses in October and take action in November.

1:08:13.500,1:08:19.260

Gedalye Szedgen: Okay as long as it doesn't impact the procurement, that was my biggest concern. Ok, thank you.

(transcript continues on p. 25, see "Next Meeting Date")

New Business

0:10:50.820,0:11:11.220

Alan Sorensen: We're going to move on...we'll move on to New Business.

Transportation Improvement Program

0:14:09.000,0:14:22.220

Alan Sorensen: So, I inadvertently skipped over the Transportation Improvement Program Local Project Sponsor updates. I just want to provide an opportunity for local Project Sponsors to provide updates.

Local Project Sponsor Updates

0:14:22.220,0:14:44.880

Mike Sweeton: Well, our project is out to bid, alright thanks to the Council and additional little OCTC money that was obtained, and the County, we should be successful... we've gotten a lot of bites on bids already, so it's a good thing. So thank you all.

0:14:44.880,0:14:46.880

Alan Sorensen: Thanks. Lauren? That's a great project.

0:14:46.880,0:14:58.560

Mike Sweeton: It is, you know, it ties in with the whole County's look at bicycle, transportation, et cetera so yeah.

0:14:58.560,0:14:59.060

Alan Sorensen: Yeah, thank you.

0:15:00.780,0:15:12.560

Jacob Tawil: Well from Middletown traffic operations, we're moving along with the construction and we're making really, major progress there and we're just going to keep going until next year...hopefully next year, we'll be good.

0:15:12.560,0:15:14.560

Alan Sorensen: That's very good. It's come along nicely.

0:15:14.560,0:15:16.560

Jacob Tawil: Thank you.

0:15:17.560,0:15:41.820

Scott Manley: City of Newburgh- the city issued for bid it's Walsh Road over the Quassaick Creek Bridge replacement. The bids came in lowest made is \$5.2M, so there was a funding shortfall about \$2.6M, and the City was able to use its New York State DOT touring-route* funds to make up that difference so it's not coming back to the Council for any more money on that, and project is being awarded.

0:15:41.820,0:15:46.200

Alan Sorensen: Thank you. Any other local project sponsors if there are?

0:15:46.200,0:16:10.680

Charlie Carnes: Crawford's sidewalks are continuing- a little bit of problem over the summer with the weather with the rain. We've had one that we had to push into Spring of 2024; we met with them a way to right away issue we seemed to convince him yesterday to sign off so, we're hoping to start that Route 52 Project first thing in the Spring.

0:16:13.260,0:16:18.800

Alan Sorensen: Charlie, thank you.
Anyone else?

0:16:18.800,0:16:20:010
All: *None*

Apportionment of FFY 2023 FTA Section 5307/5340 Formula Funds in the Mid-Hudson Valley Transportation Management Area (TMA)

0:10:50.820,0:11:11.220
Alan Sorensen: And I'll ask Lauren to go over the first item which is the apportionment of the 2023 FTA section 5307/5340 Formula Funds within the Mid-Hudson Valley Transportation Management Area.

0:11:11.220,0:11:15.840
inaudible

0:11:15.840,0:11:22.020
Alan Sorensen: Oh yeah... let's come back to that, okay? But thank you, yes.

0:11:25.140,0:13:29.480
Lauren Bennett: Yes, so here are the apportionments of the Federal Fiscal Year 2023 FTA funds for the Mid-Hudson Valley Transportation Management Area. This is based on the 2010 Census Area for the Newburgh Urbanized Area, so we still do have to split with New Jersey; but this is for FTA section 5307 funding. And then the next we will show, is the Section 5339. So first we'll look at the 5307 funding: so, the full 2023 allocation is just over \$27M for our MPO areas- for that TMA area. So, it's split between the three MPO's within New York: Dutchess, Orange and Ulster. Also, there's a portion that goes to MTA and a small portion that goes to New Jersey. And then between the 2022 and the 2023, we did change the way that we looked at the formulas. This is because, previously, we had a lot of leftover funding in that 'unallocated' [balance], and then we'd have to come back and do more resolutions to split that up. The TMA, as a whole, decided to look at a different formula, so it is based on operating expenses. So, in 2022 just in comparison, Orange County got \$9.2M, with the total having \$5.2M Unallocated for the 2022 split. And in 2023, OC is receiving around \$11.5M and there's only \$2.5M unallocated for future projects. As a reminder, Section 5307 Urbanized Area funding is a grant program- it's the largest FTA grant program, and it makes Federal resources available to Urban Areas for Transit Capital Operating assistance and whatnot.

Are there any questions on the 5307 allocations?

0:13:29:200,0:13:31.005
All: *None*

Apportionment of FFY 2023 FTA Section 5339 Formula Funds in the Mid-Hudson Valley Transportation Management Area (TMA)

0:13:31.080,0:13:58.820

Lauren Bennett: Ok, we'll just look at the 5339. So again, this is the similar split - it's slightly higher than the 2022 because of inflation. So, we- OC, Orange County- are receiving \$759K. And last year we got \$728K, so just a slight increase there.

0:13:59.880,0:14:06.840

Alan Sorensen: I think the allocations are available to the Orange County Transportation Council website, probably the main takeaway; Lauren, thank you.

Apportionment of Federal Transit Funding from the American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) of 2021 in the Mid-Hudson Valley TMA

0:16:20.040,0:18:20.240

Alan Sorensen: Alright, so next I'll go over the apportionment of the Federal Transit funding from the American Rescue Plan for 2021 in the Mid-Hudson Valley TMA; if you recall back in March 11, 2021, American Rescue Act was signed into law that supported national Public Transit systems as they continue to respond to COVID-19, and how to support the nation's public transit systems, so we had that money allocated to us as a result of the coveted pandemic response. The New York portion of Poughkeepsie-Newburgh Urbanized Area that was received was \$65M. the upper funds were adopted in Resolution 22-05; \$28.48M was left unallocated for future TMA programming. We met with our colleagues over in Dutchess and Ulster, went back and forth. Also had meetings of our TMA and arrived at a recommended split of that funding. So, the three (3) MPO's have decided to split the unallocated funding and spend it down on operating costs, then switching the funds sets aside for operating assistance to Capital purchases and allowing for more flexibility in our spending timeline. Because with the ARPA funding, as you know - either we use those funds and allocate them, or risk you know, having them clawed back. So, I think we came to a very good consensus on the allocation, and we'll be asking for the Board's endorsement of that. Moving [along], so...

0:18:20.580,0:18:24.520

Michael Weeks: Alan, what are the County's Plan going to propose?

0:18:24.520,0:18:26.520

Mike Sweeton: Yeah, that would be a question.

0:18:27.540,0:18:33.760

Alan Sorensen: Well, we're going to use these funds for Operating Assistance

0:18:33.760,0:18:35.760

Mike Weeks: So, what's that for?

0:18:35.760,0:18:38.520

Alan Sorensen: Current are...we have contracts that...

0:18:40.520,0:19:13.860

Rob Parrington: Alan, do you want me to chime in?

Sorry I sound horrible, everybody. This is Rob. We're going to leverage these funds to continue the 100% operating assistance to all the bus operators. So forever, since CARES came out, they-the bus operators -haven't had a local match as far as Federal operating assistance, which is typically 50/50 match Federal to State, it's a local, so this continues to support the local bus operators with 100% Federal for their operations.

0:19:13.860,0:19:15.180

Jason Morris: All \$15M?

0:19:15.180,0:19:15.737

Alan Sorensen: Yeah.

0:19:15.737,0:19:21.480

Jason Morris: What is their budget annually?

0:19:21.480,0:19:38.120

Rob Parrington: Uh, that's a good question but this should take us for another two years; when we did the estimates it was two years' worth of funding...so it's hard to say for sure if it will last the two years, we're confident that it will but you know expenses change unexpectedly as we all know.

0:19:38.120,0:19:40.120

Jason Morris: Two (2) years' worth of match, right?

0:19:40.140,0:19:55.860

Rob Parrington: This is two years' worth of 100% Federal operating assistance to cover the bus operator; so, for another two (2) years there won't be any local match from the Operators. If this money lasts as projected for two (2) years, there won't be any local match from bus operators for federal operating assistance.

0:19:55.860,0:19:59.560

Jason Morris: Which operators does that cover? All of them or anyone that gets funding in Orange County?

0:20:02.580,0:20:11.520

Rob Parrington: so, it would be all the town Dial-A-Ride; it would be all the local fixed route services in the Paratransit service.

0:20:11.520,0:20:12.640

Jason Morris: Thank you.

0:20:12.640,0:20:14.640

Rob Parrington: You're welcome.

0:20:14.640,0:20:16.004

Alan Sorensen: Rob, thank you.

0:20:16.004,0:20:16.640

Rob Parrington: You're welcome.

0:20:20.040,0:20:32.220

Alan Sorensen: I guess also you know potentially freeze up other 5307 funding for Capital so it's a win-win.

Apportionment of Federal Transit Funding from the Coronavirus Response and Relief Supplemental Appropriations Act (CRRSAA) of 2021 in the Mid-Hudson Valley TMA

0:20:32.220,0:21:11.700

Alan Sorensen: Now, we also have the apportionment of Federal Transit funding from the Coronavirus Response and Relief, CRRSAA program. And again, we met with our colleagues at the MPO and arrived at a percent allocation which you see- is up there on the screen; so Orange County projected is a little under \$1M for Orange County, and you see the split there on the screen.

0:21:15.480,0:21:27.540

Jacob Tawil: So, Alan sorry, you guys are negotiating for these numbers? Because I see Orange County is getting like the lion's share- which is very good, I mean is that something negotiable? I mean is that something you guys are...?

0:21:27.540,0:21:48.320

Alan Sorensen: Well part of it's based on, you know, the ridership, and the utilization of the services. If you recall about a year ago, there was a point where I don't know if it was DOT or FTA, was thinking of changing the formula, and it resulted in a dramatic decrease-

0:21:48.320,0:21:50.340

Jacob Tawil: Yeah, I remember that, sure.

0:21:50.340,0:23:04.800

Alan Sorensen: So, we, you know, asked them to revisit that, which they did, and so that maintained our allocation but you know, as you can see Dutchess and in Orange, you know, have few of the more...robust transit services, you know in the TMA. But it's...we have to make decisions within the TMA by consensus and so we're always looking to, you know, arrive at a fair and equitable distribution of funding based on the needs of the of the Council members.

Yeah, and with that these items will show up, I am going to wait. I want to give Gedalye...I got five minutes; I can burn up five minutes. I'll go off on a few tangents, and Lauren, anything else we need to cover before we?

0:23:07.260,0:23:22.680

Lauren Bennett: I mean, we could. I think there's a section in the Policy Board on updates, so we could move into the Policy Board and go through some of those resolutions and then when Gedalye joins, go back to it?

0:23:22.680,0:23:23.680

Alan Sorensen: Yeah.

0:23:23.680,0:23:49.260

Mike Sweeton: I could ask a question. I had asked about the previous round of Bridge NY, and the process by which that was determined. Our understanding on the Council going in was, it was going to be a locally focused analysis. Then it turned out the decisions were made by NYSDOT, outside of that.

0:23:51.360,0:24:00.300

Alan Sorensen: No... I wouldn't...I wouldn't I said that. It would be a mischaracterization. So, the...we were asked, when I say 'we,' the Transportation Council- so myself Lauren and Ryan McGuire from Orange County- were asked to review applications that came through Bridge New York and DOT had staff members assigned to it and there were other staff members as well. The way it works: we review, rank, and rate the applications based on a set criteria, independently of one another, and then those scores go to a central pairing house and then there was a meeting up in Poughkeepsie, where the reviewers then you know, in a room, reviewed the applications; if it was a specific, 'Orange County' Bridge Project, you know, Ryan and I, were asked to leave the room- our scores were not included in that that analyzes- and I, I'm assuming the same would apply if there was one of the reviewers they couldn't review their own bridge but then there was, you know, discussion amongst the reviewers for each of the projects and then a decision was made, in terms of which projects you know, rose to the top and would be funded.

0:25:26.160,0:25:30.015

Mike Sweeton: So, the question then would be- locally, you, Lauren, Ryan?

0:25:30.015,0:25:32.940

Alan Sorensen: Yeah.

0:25:32.940,0:26:15.600

Mike Sweeton: Are part of an evaluation committee locally but then forwarded those to this greater meeting so- one second - my question is what's the criteria- what were the criteria, as if you could share that? I don't want to belabor this meeting with it, but it'll be nice if we could get that information because for instance of the \$9M awarded in Orange County, \$5.6M went to Orange County. Now, maybe that's fair, maybe it's not. I mean Orange County got \$70M from ARPA money, it's hard to believe they needed \$5.6M to do bridges. So, I think for the Councilmembers- it would be interesting to know what your criteria were and how that played out. That's all, and that could be done in a future date but, I would like-

0:26:15.600,0:26:34.120

Sandra Jobson: Yes, and that criteria was also in the guidance, for the Bridge NY program. I'm just saying, if you want to look at it sooner than later. And just to step back further, Alan, I think

to see the bigger picture? So, this year, Bridge NY was administered through each of the MPO's. In the past, it was through the New York State DOT.

0:26:34.120,0:26:35.640

Mike Sweeton: Right, I get that.

0:26:35.640,0:26:44.520

Sandra Jobson: You know, really state DOT just helped guide the MPO in setting up their scoring teams.

0:26:44.520,0:26:45.000

Alan Sorensen: Yes.

0:26:45.000,0:26:50.100

Sandra Jobson: I feel like there was a representative also from the town. Didn't you also have...

0:26:50.100,0:26:51.000

Alan Sorensen: Yes, yes.

0:26:51.000,0:26:59.800

Sandra Jobson: No, there was also a town, yeah; each scoring team for each MPO had someone from the County, from the municipality, and then-

0:26:59.800,0:27:03.600

Alan Sorensen: I think it was one of the town's Supers-superintendents-

0:27:03.880,0:27:05.437

Lauren Bennett: It was the Highway Superintendent.

0:27:05.437,0:27:47.160

Sandra Jobson: And then like Alan said, then they, you know, had their meetings using the guidance that was provided in the program and then came together and reached consensus and then, the only last step that did happen is, once each of the MPO's came up with their recommended list, then that did go through a final review for New York State DOT but more from a constructability and cost, ok? Because again, we're always trying to make sure that, you know, did the team maybe miss something? And is this bridge going to cost twice as much? Right, so it went through that final review.

0:27:47.160,0:28:13.360

Mike Sweeton: Yeah, it is not so much of a DOT issue for me, it is more of a Council issue and, look, we're all part of Orange County, we get it, there's bridges that need to get fixed. But there's also Bridges-probably in each one of these towns- that might have benefited from what I understood was a 15% allocation of that Bridge NY money, it was supposed to go to local non-traditional roads, right? Non-federal Roads.

0:28:13.360,0:28:14.346

Sandra Jobson: Yeah, I am not familiar with that.

0:28:14.346,0:28:18.240

Mike Sweeton: So, I don't know what that 15 number is there is?

0:28:18.360,0:28:24.600

Alan Sorensen: There are still some dollars left and then we were going to come back to the Council you know with this.

0:28:24.600,0:28:26.720

Sandra Jobson: How many applications did Orange County receive?

0:28:26.720,0:28:28.201

Lauren Bennett: I think eight (8).

0:28:28.201,0:28:31.720

Sandra Jobson: Okay, and then you were able to award three (3) out of the eight (8) or ?

0:28:31.720,0:28:34.000

Mike Sweeton: Uh, four (4), I think Walkkill, which is fine. Love Walkkill, right.

0:28:34.000,0:28:35.120

Lauren Bennett: Yeah.

0:28:36.720,0:28:44.720

Mike Sweeton: Not to knock Orange County but you know, listen- they got a lot of money from ARPA, so...

0:28:44.720,0:29:00.480

Alan Sorensen: No, understood. You know, I'm not being defensive when I say it but, our score- l... we were not allowed to score those, you know, those of us from Orange County. So, we... we did not score those.

0:29:01.500,0:29:04.160

Sandra Jobson: How much unallocated off-system bridge funding do you have?

0:29:04.160,0:29:12.840

Alan Sorensen: I think it's close to \$2M. So, there are some dollars in the unallocated off-system that we want to come back to the Council.

0:29:12.840,0:29:18.300

Mike Sweeton: It's really a philosophical question between the Council and the County really.

0:29:18.300,0:29:33.660

Alan Sorensen: Yeah, there's one...there's one project that was like, just missed getting funded that might actually benefit from that but um, I wanted to get through this process and then come back to the Council.

0:29:34.620,0:29:44.920

Sandra Jobson: I think it's an important conversation though because I think overall, this new strategy for all was successful, right?

0:29:45.920,0:29:46.920

Jacob Tawil: For the winners, right?

0:29:46.920,0:29:49.000

Laughter

0:29:49.920,0:29:59.520

Sandra Jobson: I think from a standpoint of speed and getting good local input, I think it was. So, I'm hopeful that Bridge NY will go the same way. So I would definitely say the Council at this point should have those discussions because you can tweak it, right. This was the first time so, maybe there is some opportunity for you know, you kind of hearing more transparency, or maybe you want to see that tentative list? You know, there's room probably from improvement to that in two (2) years from now that goes in the same direction, and you can incorporate that.

0:30:25.320,0:30:32.787

Jacob Tawil: Okay yeah, I guess I really support Michael with his request about, you know, we need just the guidance- how can we improve our application basically.

0:30:32.787,0:30:34.387

Alan Sorensen: Okay.

0:30:34.387,0:30:53.040

Jacob Tawil: Your scoring, you know. What are you scoring? You know, 'we're scoring', 'we're looking for this' and 'this' and 'this,' I mean- one of the bridges sorry, it's been red flagged by DOT for many years in Middletown, and still, we didn't get funded. I'm not saying the other ones are not put up, but we need to...we need to know how to improve our future applications.

0:30:53.040,0:30:54.640

Anthony Cardone: Do you have a grant writer?

0:30:54.640,0:30:55.140

Jacob Tawil: No.

0:30:55.140,0:31:02.000

Anthony Cardone: The applicational process is fairly onerous too; I mean it's not putting that application together is inexpensive-

0:31:02.000,0:31:03.320

Jacob Tawil: Exactly.

0:31:03.320,0:31:35.680

Anthony Cardone: So, our grant writer wrote a grant for Bridge NY for us, and we did not obviously, get the money. But we then went on a 'recap' afterwards, and they told us why we didn't

get the money. So, there are areas where we can improve it, which we're going to shut the road down- because that was one of the...one of the issues, we have a 100-year-old it's like a bridge-culvert, whatever you want to call it, so you know, we were informed through those meetings.

0:31:36.920,0:31:48.600

Sandra Jobson: I was going to suggest the same thing- is that for any municipality maybe that, you know, didn't get funding in this round, if you want more specific insight, we can, you know, schedule a meeting.

0:31:51.600,0:32:36.780

Jacob Tawil: We did that, like two years ago? In the previous application. And really, we tried to accommodate...but the person, I don't think he is even there, the guy who did the review for us, just giving his personal [opinions]; if there's some guidelines in there? The scoring- like Alan he said, we have to do the scoring in there- this one, 0/10 for this point, this is what we need your scoring...your scoring, basically, 'sheet' in there, then we'll know what to concentrate and focus on; what Michael was saying- these are very expensive to put together. It's not like, you know...because you have to have a cost-estimate, like you said. Preliminary plans and reasons, and justification it's a significant amount of work that goes into it.

0:32:36.780,0:32:41.940

Anthony Cardone: And then the engineers, from what I understand, the engineers doing your preliminary plans, are not allowed to be involved in the construction?

0:32:42.920,0:32:44.240

Jacob Tawil: Uh, no...

0:32:44.240,0:32:46.240

Scott Manley: Not true, no.

0:32:46.240,0:32:50.640

Jason Morris: Your engineer has to be on the DOT list.

0:32:50.640,0:32:53.940

Tony Cardone: We did the bridge- you guys did, you guys wrote all the specs for it and everything- that's

0:32:53.940,0:32:57.446

Jason Morris: We're not on the DOT list, so that's why.

0:33:00.040,0:33:02.040

Michael Weeks: Yeah, I mean I just wanted to bring up the point also, you get additional points if your application is reviewed or submitted through a professional engineering firm and yes, the firm has to be in the DOT's list for region.

0:33:21.041,0:33:26.700

Jacob Tawil: Ok, so it'll be helpful if you get these scoring points for us.

0:33:27.540,0:33:51.360

Alan Sorensen: We... I'm sure we can share the rating criteria so let's do that as a starter. And I would encourage you know, those members you know, who weren't successful this round to reach out to DOT because I think just having that ability to be briefed on you know, why certain things rated higher and way up less points on other aspects of the application.

0:33:54.360,0:33:55.360

Ryan McGuire: Alan? This is Ryan over in DPW.

0:33:55.360,0:33:57.300

Alan Sorensen: Ryan, yes.

0:33:57.300,0:34:00.284

Ryan McGuire: Can I just add something to the discussion?

0:34:00.284,0:34:01.960

Alan Sorensen: Yeah.

0:34:04.980,0:34:56.280

Ryan McGuire: I think a lot of this scoring...there's a lot of discussion about right-of-way and, anything you can do to identify property boundaries or Highway boundaries really, I think adds to your score because right-of-way, it becomes a monstrous pass during the development of these projects and that causes delivery risk. And I think that that was one of the higher point values on the scoring chart. So, if there's any record surveys that you might have at your Buildings Department or Highway maps or record bridge plans or anything that you can have a good idea of what your property boundaries are, which would eliminate the need for temporary easements, property acquisition, etc. and I think that that would definitely increase everybody's score, if you could supply that.

0:34:56.280,0:34:57.300

Jacob Tawil: A bridge is bad and falling apart- if you don't have right-of-way, you're out of luck.

0:34:57.300,0:35:04.080

Alan Sorensen: It becomes a project delivery concern, right?

0:35:04.080,0:35:06.080

Sandra Jobson: Right, but the funding that is used for that program, Orange County- this Council- also has access to those funds directly. So...and it sounds like you have some unallocated. So again, understanding that right then maybe those are bridges that are better, if you're going to take more of a strategic you know, approaches more strategically, right? You kind of understand all of your needs from the MPO and you're going to know - some candidates are going to be better for Bridge NY, right? And then some of these other structures might be better because there might be high need but also high risk. That might be better for the Orange County Bridge funding (off-system), yes.

0:35:54.480,0:36:11.040

Tony Cardone: So, are you saying that I can apply- the Town of Monroe- can apply through the Orange County Transportation Council for bridge funding?

0:36:11.040,0:36:18.060

Sandra Jobson: bridge funding? Yeah, yeah. They have some unallocated; now how this Board vote decides to do that- are you going to do Call for Project, are you going to just distribute it within them? That's all-

0:36:18.960,0:36:20.960

Alan Sorensen: Yeah, we need to have more conversations on that.

0:36:25.560,0:36:57.660

Stacy Butler: Just to speak to the issue that Ryan raised: and this is something I don't know when Letters of Intent to grant temporary or permanent easement scope, or in the application I don't know but more information usually does help so, that might be something you can talk to Peter, local attorney, about to something if you have a bridge and you don't have site control- do a Letter of Intent to grant that, either temporary easement or property acquisition.

Next Meeting Date – October 24, 2023 at 10AM

1:08:22.820,1:08:24.480

Alan Sorensen: And with that, I'll ask for a motion to adjourn.

1:08:25.480,1:08:26.200

Anthony Cardone: *Motion*

1:08:26.200,1:08:27.280

Jacob Tawil: I'll second.

1:08:23.820,1:08:30.480

Alan Sorensen: So moved. Tony and also, Jacob. Ok.
Alright the meeting is adjourned.

This meeting was adjourned at 11:08 AM.